STUDIES IN ANCIENT MEDITERRANEAN RELIGIONS 1

Sandra Blakely (ed.)

Gods, Objects, and Ritual Practice



LOCKWOOD PRESS

GODS, OBJECTS, AND RITUAL PRACTICE

LOCKWOOD PRESS

Studies in Ancient Mediterranean Religions

Sandra Blakely, Series Editor

Number One
Gods, Objects, and Ritual Practice

GODS, OBJECTS, AND RITUAL PRACTICE

Edited by

Sandra Blakely



LOCKWOOD PRESS
2017

Gods, Objects, and Ritual Practice

Copyright © 2017 by Lockwood Press

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to Lockwood Press, PO Box 133289, Atlanta, GA 30333 USA.

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017952620

ISBN: 978-1-937040-79-6

Cover design by Susanne Wilhelm.

Cover image: Black-figured column krater fragment with scene of Achilles and Ajax; Michael C. Carlos Museum, Gift of Dr. Dietrich von Bothmer, 2004.33.2; photograph by Bruce M. White, 2005 © Michael C. Carlos Museum, Emory University.

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper.

Contents

Abbreviations vii

Contributors xvii

1 Introduction: Object, Image, and Text: Materiality and Ritual Practice in the Ancient Mediterranean
Sandra Blakely 1

Section 1. From Image to Context: Iconography and Polysemnity

2 Divine Twins or Saintly Twins: The Dioscuri in an Early Christian Context
Annewies van den Hoek 17

3 Altars, Astragaloi, Achilles: Picturing Divination on Athenian Vases
Sheramy D. Bundrick 53

4 Incarnating the *Aurea Aetas*: Theomorphic Rhetoric and the Portraits of Nero
Eric R. Varner 75

Section 2. Reading the Gods: Texts and Gifts

5 No More Than One Candle, Torch, or Wreath: Private Citizens and the Commemoration of L. Caesar at Pisa
J. Bert Lott 119

6 The Cadence of the Language of Magic in Greek Curse Tablets and First Corinthians
Jill E. Marshall 129

7 Sacred Objects, Material Value, and Invective in Cicero's Verrines II 4
Isabel Köster 151

Section 3. Implements and Images

8 Local Production and Domestic Ritual Use of Small Rectangular Incense Altars: A Petrographic Provenience Analysis and Examination of Craftsmanship of the Tell Halif Incense Altars
Seung Ho Bang, Oded Borowski, Kook Young Yoon, Yuval Goren 171

9 Judaean Pillar Figurines and the Making of Female Piety in Ancient Israelite Religion
Erin Darby 193

10 Priestesses in Action: Ritual Instruments Employed by Roman Women
Meghan J. DiLuzio 215

11 Rhetoric, Repetition, and Identity in the Frieze of Sacred Objects on the Temple of Divus Vespasian and Divus Titus
Susan Ludi Blevins 233

Section 4. Sites and Structures: Gods, Men, and Cultural Identities

12 Channeling Identity: The Fountain of Glauke in Corinth and Jacob's Well in John 4
Eric Moore 261

13 "In This Holy Place": Incubation at Hot Springs in Roman and Late Antique Palestine
Megan S. Nutzman 281

14 Gods, Graves, and Extratextual Rituals in Archaic Colonial Sicily
Lela M. Urquhart 305

Subject Index 329

Ancient Sources Index 337

Abbreviations

AAE	*Arabian Archaeology and Epigraphy*
AAEA	Anejos de Archivo español de arqueología
ABAW	Abhandlungen der Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften
ABD	*Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Edited by David Noel Freedman. 6 vols. New York: Doubleday, 1992.
ʿAbod. Zar.	*ʿAbodah Zarah*
ABSA	*Annual of the British School at Athens*
Aen.	Vergil *Aeneid*
Agr.	Cicero *De Lege agraria*
AIRF	Acta Instituti Romani Finlandiae
A.J.	Josephus *Antiquitates judaicae*
AJA	*American Journal of Archaeology*
AJP	*American Journal of Philology*
Alex.	Lucian *Alexander (Pseudomantis)*
AMD	Ancient Magic and Divination
AMuGS	Antike Münzen und geschnittene Steine
Ann.	*Annales*
ANRW	*Aufstieg und Niedergang der Römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms im Spiegel der neueren Forschung*. Part 2, *Principat*. Edited by Hildegard Temporini and Wolfgang Haase. Berlin: de Gruyter, 1972–.
AnSt	*Anatolian Studies*
AntAf	*Antiquités africaines*
AntK	*Antike Kunst*
Ant. rom.	Dionysius of Halicarnassus *Antiquitates romanae*
AOS	American Oriental Series
APAAA	Archeological Papers of the American Anthropological Association
Apocol.	Seneca *Apocolocyntosis*
ARA	*Annual Review of Anthropology*
Arch	*Archaeology*
ArchCl	*Archeologia classica*
ARG	*Archiv für Religionsgeschichte*

Argon.	Apollonius Rhodius *Argonautica*
ARID	*Analecta Romana Instituti Danici*
ARP	*Accordia Research Papers*
ARS	African Red Slip ware
Att.	Cicero *Epistulae ad Atticum*
b.	born; ben
b.	Babylonian Talmud tractate
BA	*Biblical Archaeologist*
Balb.	Cicero *Pro Balbo*
BAPD	*Beazley Archive Pottery Database* (www.beazley.ox.ac.uk)
Bapt.	Tertullian *De baptismo*
BAR	*Biblical Archaeology Review*
BARIS	British Archaeological Reports International Series
BASOR	*Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research*
BCAW	Blackwell Companions to the Ancient World
BCH	*Bulletin de correspondance héllenique*
BCHSup	Bulletin de correspondance hellénique Supplément
Ber.	Berakot
BiAMA	Bibliothèque d'Archéologie Méditerranéenne et Africaine
Bibl.	Diodorus Siculus *Bibliotheca historica*; Apollodorus *Bibliotheca*
BICSSup	Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies Supplement
B.J.	Josephus *Bellum judaicum*
BKP	Beiträge zur klassischen Philologie
BMCRE	*Coins of the Roman Empire in the British Museum*. Harold Mattingly, ed. London: British Museum, 1923–.
BMFA	*Bulletin of the Museum of Fine Arts (Boston)*
BNP	*Brill's New Pauly: Encyclopaedia of the Ancient World*. Edited by Hubert Cancik. 22 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2002–2011.
BNTC	Black's New Testament Commentaries
Brev. Vit.	Seneca *De brevitate vitae*
BSGA	Blackwell Studies in Global Archaeology
BSOAS	*Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*
c. Symm.	Prudentius *contra Symmachum*
CA	*Current Anthropology*
ca.	circa
Cal.	Suetonius *Gaius Caligula*
Cat.	Cicero *In Catalinam*
cat.	catalog
CBQ	*Catholic Biblical Quarterly*
CD	Cairo Genizah copy of the Damascus Document

CÉFR	Collection de l'École française de Rome
CHANE	Culture and History of the Ancient Near East
CHSC	Center for Hellenic Studies Colloquia
CIL	*Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum* (1863–)
CJ	*Classical Journal*
ClAnt	*Classical Antiquity*
Claud.	Suetonius *Divus Claudius*
Clem.	Seneca *De clementia*
ClQ	*Classical Quarterly*
CM	Cuneiform Monograph
col(s).	column(s)
Cons. Hon	Claudianus *De consulatu Honorii*
Cor.	Plutarch *Marcius Coriolanus*
CP	*Classical Philology*
CRHPhR	Cahiers de la Revue d'histoire et de philosophie religieuses
CSCAI	Cambridge Studies in Classical Art and Iconography
CSCT	Columbia Studies in the Classical Tradition
CSHJ	Chicago Studies in the History of Judaism
CSSCA	Cambridge Studies in Social and Cultural Anthropology
CWA	Cambridge World Archaeology
DACL	*Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienneet de liturgie*. Edited by Fernan Cabrol. 15 vols. Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1907–1953.
De or.	Cicero *De oratore*
Descr.	Pausanius *Graeciae descriptio*
diam.	diameter
Diatr.	Epictetus *Daitribai* (*Dissertationes*)
Dig.	*Digesta*
Div. Caec.	Cicero *Divinatio in Caecilium*
Div. quaest. LXXXIII	Augustine *De diuersis quaestionibus LXXXIII*
DOP	*Dumbarton Oaks Papers*
DT	August Audollent, *Defixionum Tabellae*. Paris: Fontemoing, 1904.
DWhG	Deutsche Wasserhistorische Gesellschaft
Ebib	Etudes Bibliques
ECC	Eerdmans Critical Commentary
Eccl. Rab.	Rabbah Ecclesiastes
Ecl.	*xuae*
Eins. Ecl.	Einsiedlin Eclogues
Enarrat. Ps.	Augustine *Enarrationes in Psalmos*
Ep.	*Epistulae*
Epod.	Horace *Epodi*

EPRO	Etudes préliminaires aux religions orientales dans l'Empire romain
ʿErub.	ʿErubin
Fab.	Plutarch *Fabius Maximus*; Hyginus *Fabulae*
Fast.	Ovid *Fasti*
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
fig(s).	figure(s)
flor.	floruit
frag.	fragment
FRLANT	Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
Gen. Rab.	Rabbah Genesis
Geogr.	Strabo *Geographica*
Georg.	Vergil *Georgica*
GR	*Greece and Rome*
GRBS	*Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies*
Har. resp.	Cicero *De haruspicum responso*
HAW	Handbuch der altertumswissenschaft
HdA	Handbuch der Archäologie, Vorderasien
Her.	Philo *De rerum divinaraum heres sit*; Ovid *Heroides*
Hesperia	*Hesperia: The Journal of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens*
Hist.	Herodotus *Historiae*
Hist. Aug., Comm.	Historia Augusta, Commodus
Hist. Eccl.	Sozomenus *Historia Ecclesiastica*
Hor. C.	Porphyry's comments on Horace *Carmina*
HR	*History of Religions*
HSCP	*Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*
HTR	*Harvard Theological Review*
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
HUCA	*Hebrew Union College Annual*
Ḥul.	Ḥullin
IAAR	Israel Antiquities Authority Reports
IEJ	*Israel Exploration Journal*
IG.3 *Sup.*	*Inscriptiones Graecae.* Vol. 3: *Supplement*. Edited by Richard Wünsch. Berlin: Deutsche Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, 1903.
IGRom	*Inscriptiones Graecae ad res Romanas pertinentes* (1906–)
IJAHS	*International Journal of African Historical Studies*
illus.	illustration
ILS	H. Dessau. *Inscriptiones Latinae Selectae*. Berlin, 1892–1916.

Inst.	Lactantius *Divinarum institutionum libri VII*; Quintilian *Institutio oratoria*
Isaac	Ambrose *De Isaac vel anima*
Isoc.	Dionysus of Halicarnasus *De Isocrate*
IstMitt	*Istanbuler Mitteilungen*
Itin.	Egeria *Itinerarium Egeriae*
JAMT	*Journal of Archaeological Method and Theory*
JBL	*Journal of Biblical Literature*
JCH	*Journal of Cognitive Historiography*
JCM	Jews, Christians, and Muslims from the Ancient to the Modern World
JCPS	*Jewish and Christian Perspectives Series*
JdI	*Jahrbuch des deutschen archäologischen Instituts*
JECS	*Journal of Early Christian Studies*
JFA	*Journal of Field Archaeology*
JHI	*Journal of the History of Ideas*
JHS	*Journal of Hellenic Studies*
JMEMSt	*Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*
JPF	Judean pillar figurines
JPICL	Joan Palevsky Imprint in Classical Literature
JQR	*Jewish Quarterly Review*
JRAI	*Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* NS
JRASup	Journal of Roman Archaeology, Supplement
JRS	*Journal of Roman Studies*
JSJSup	Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series
JWP	*Journal of World Prehistory*
Ketub.	Ketubbot
KölnJb	Kölner Jahrbuch für Vor- und Frühgeschichte
KTAH	Key Themes in Ancient History
Lahav	Reports of the Lahav Research Project, Excavations at Tell Halif, Israel
LAHR	Late Antique History and Religion
LAI	Library of Ancient Israel
LASBF	*Liber Annuus Studii Biblici Franciscani*
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LCM	Laboratory for Comparative Microarchaeology
LCS	Lang Classical Studies
Leg.	Cicero *De legibus*

LIMC	*Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae*. Zurich: Artemis, 1981–.
Ling.	Varro *De lingua latina*
LRP	Lahav Research Project
LTUR	*Lexicon Topographicum Urbis Romae*. Edited by Eva Margereta Steinby. 6 vols. Rome: Quasar, 1993–2000.
m.	Mishnah tractate
MAAR	*Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome*
MAARSup	Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome Supplement
Marc.	Tertullian *Adversus Marcionem*
Maxim.	Augustine *Contra Maximinum Arianum*
MDAI(R)	*Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Römische Abteilung*
Med.	*Medea*
MededRom	*Mededelingen van het Nederlands Instituut te Rome*
MedEnc	*Medieval Encounters*
MeditArch	*Mediterranean Archaeology*
MEFRA	*Mélanges de l'Ecole française de Rome: Antiquité*
Metam.	Ovid *Metamorphoses*
MGR	Monumenta Graeca et Romana
MHNH	*Revista Internacional de Investigación sobre Magia y Astrologia Antiguas*
Migr.	Philo *De migratione Abrahami*
Mil.	Cicero *Pro Milone*
Mor.	Plutarch *Moralia*
MS	Mnemosyne Supplementum
MSS	manuscripts
n(n).	note(s)
N. A.	Aulus Gellius *Noctes Atticae*
NBACr	*Nuovo Bullettino di Archeologia Cristiana*
NA^{28}	*Novum Testamentum Graece*, Nestle-Aland 28th ed.
NAC	*Numismatica e antichità classiche*
Nat.	Seneca *Naturales questiones*; Pliny the Elder *Naturalis historia*
Nat. grat.	Augustine *De natura et gratia*
NEA	*Near Eastern Archaeology*
NEAEHL	*The New Encyclopedia of Archaeological Excavations in the Holy Land*. 5 vols. Edited by Ephraim Stern. Jerusalem: Israel Exploration Society, 1993–2008.
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NIGTC	New International Greek Testament Commentary

NNM	Numismatic Notes and Monographs
no.	number
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum
NTS	*New Testament Studies*
Num.	Plutarch *Numa*
Obj(s).	Object(s)
OBO	Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis
OBOSA	Orbis Biblicus et Orientalis Series Archaeologica
OCM	Oxford Classical Monographs
OCT	Oxford Classical Texts
Off.	Cicero *De officiis*
OJA	*Oxford Journal of Archaeology*
OLA	Orientalia Lovaniensia Analecta
OMRL	*Oudheidkundige Mededelingen uit het Rijksmuseum van Oudheden te Leiden*
Onom.	Eusebius *Onomasticon*
Opuscula	*Opuscula: Annual of the Swedish Institutes at Athens and Rome*
Ord.	Augustine *De ordine*
ORF	H. Malcovati, *Oratorum Romanorum fragmenta liberae rei pvblicae*. 4th ed. Torino: Paravia, 1976.
Orig.	Isadorus *Origenes*
OSCC	*Oklahoma Series in Classical Culture*
PAB	Potsdamer altertumswissenschaftliche Beiträge
Pan.	Epiphanius *Panarion* (*Adversus haereses*); Pliny *Panegyricus*
P.Oxy.	Grenfell, Bernard P., et al., eds. *The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*. London: Egypt Exploration Fund, 1898–.
PAPhS	*Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*
PBSR	*Papers of the British School at Rome*
PDM	Demotic texts in Hans Dieter Betz, *The Greek Magical Papyri in Translation, Including the Demotic Spells*. 2nd edition. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
PEQ	*Palestine Exploration Quarterly*
PGM	*Papyri Graecae Magicae: Die Griechischen Zauberpapyri*. Edited by Karl Preisendanz. 2nd ed. Stuttgart: Teubner, 1973–1974.
pl(s).	plate(s)
PMAAR	Papers and Monographs of the American Academy in Rome
POC	*Proche-Orient Chrétien*
P. Oxy.	Oxyrhynchus Papyri

Qidd.	Qiddušin
Quaest. rom.	Plutarch *Quaestiones romanae et graecae*
QuadMess	*Quaderni dell'Istituto di archeologia della Facoltà di lettere e filosofia, Universitä di Messina*
R.	Rabbi
RAC	*Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*. Edited by Theodor Klauser et al. Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1950–.
RAr	*Revue archéologique*
RB	*Revue Biblique*
RdA	*Rivista di archeologia*
REL	*Revue des Études Latines*
Res gest. divi Aug.	Res gestae dvi Augusti
rev.	reverse (of tablet)
RGRW	Religions in the Graeco-Roman World
RhMus	*Rheinisches Museum*
RIC	*The Roman Imperial Coinage*. Edited by Harold Mattingly et al. London: Spink, 1923–.
RIC^2	*The Roman Imperial Coinage*. Edited by Harold Mattingly et al. London: Spink, 2007–
RPAA	*Atti della Pontificia Accademia romana di Archeologia: Rendiconti*
RPC	Roman Provincial Coinage Project
RRP	Religion der römischen Provinzen
RSQ	*Rhetoric Society Quarterly*
RSR	*Recherches de science religieuse*
RVV	Religionsgeschichtliche Versuche und Vorarbeiten
Šabb.	Šabbat
SAM	Studies in Ancient Medicine
SANER	Studies in Ancient Near Eastern Records
Sat.	Macrobius *Saturnalia*; Juvenal *Satirae*
SBLMS	Society of Biblical Literature Monograph Series
ScAnt	*Scienze dell'Antichita: Storia, archeologia, antropologia*
ScrHier	Scripta Hierosolymitana
Šeb.	Šebi'it
SGRR	Studies in Greek and Roman Religion
SHGR	Studies in the History of Greece and Rome
SMNIA	Tel Aviv University Sonia and Marco Nadler Institute of Archaeology Monograph Series
SMSR	*Studi e materiali di storia delle religioni*
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
SO	*Symbolae Osloenses*

Sol.	Plutarch *Solon*
Spect.	Tertullian *De spectaculis*
SSCA	Stockholm Studies in Classical Archaeology
str.	stratum
StOr	*Studia Orientalia*
SWBA	Social World of Biblical Antiquity Series: Second series
t.	Tosefta tractate
tab.	table
TAOP	Tel Aviv: Journal of the Institute of Archaeology of Tel Aviv University, Occasional Publications
TAPA	*Transactions of the American Philological Association*
TAPS	Transactions of the American Philosophical Society
TCS	Texts from Cuneiform Sources
TDNT	*Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*. Edited by Gerhard Kittel and Gerhard Friedrich. Translated by Geoffrey W. Bromiley. 10 vols. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964–1976.
ThesCRA	*Thesaurus Cultus et Rituum Antiquorum*. Los Angeles: Getty Museum, 2004–.
Tim.	Plato *Timaeus*
TLL	*Thesaurus Linguae Latinae*
TSAJ	Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum/Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism
Tr.	Ovid *Tristia*
Trac. Ev. Jo.	Augustine *In Evangelium Johannis tractatus*
Trin.	Augustine *De trinitate*
TZ	*Theologische Zeitschrift*
UCOP	University of Cambridge Oriental Publications
Var. Hist.	Aelian *Varia Historia*
Verr.	Cicero *In Verrem*
Vit. Par.	Plutarch *Vitae Parallelae*
WA	*World Archaeology*
WGRWSup	Writings on the Greco-Roman World Supplement Series
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
y.	Jerusalem Talmud tractate
YCS	Yale Classical Studies
ZA	*Zeitschrift für Assyriologie und Vorderasiatische Archäologie*
ZAC	*Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum/Journal of Ancient Christianity*
ZDPV	*Zeitschrift des Deutschen Palästina- Vereins*
ZPE	*Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik*

Contributors

Sandra Blakely is associate professor of classics at Emory University, with research interests in Greek religion, historiography, digital approaches to antiquity, and the anthropology and ethnography of the ancient world. Her current research project, The Anthropology of an Island Cult, focuses on maritime ritual and the mystery cult of the Great Gods of Samothrace, using ArcGIS and network modeling to test the hypothesis of the cult's effectiveness in creating safety for travelers at sea. Recent publications include "Maritime Risk and Ritual Responses: Sailing with the Gods in the Ancient Mediterranean" in C. Buchet and P. de Souza, ed.s, Oceanides (Association Oceanides: Paris 2016), and "Beyond Braudel: Network Models and a Samothracian Seascape" in L. Mazurek and C. Concannon, ed.s, Across the Corrupting Sea (Routledge 2016). sblakel@emory.edu

Susan Ludi Blevins researches the relationship between material culture, religion, and memory in the Roman and Greek world; the intersection of visual culture with issues of identity, power and representation; the topography and built environment of sacred space; and cognition and visual culture. She has taught at Washington University in St. Louis, the University of Georgia Program in Cortona, and Wheaton College in Massachusetts. She is a Postdoctoral Fellow in the Department of Art History and Archaeology at Washington University in St. Louis and a member of the excavation team at the Sanctuary of the Great Gods on Samothrace. Blevins.susan@wustl.edu

Oded Borowski is professor of biblical archaeology and Hebrew at Emory University. He has conducted field work at Gezer, Dan, Ashkelon, and Beth Shemesh, and helped initiate the Lahav Research Project, an excavation and survey in Tel Halif and its environs. He has been co-director of Phase III and director of Phase IV of research at Tell Halif. His research has focused on ancient agriculture, daily life and foodways in Iron Age Israel, Hezekiah's reforms, the Iron Age Cemetery at Tel Halif, and the study of Hebrew: his books include Lahav III: The Iron Age II Cemetery at Tell Halif (Site 72) (Eisenbrauns 2013), Daily Life in Biblical Times (Brill 2003), Every Living Thing: The Daily Use of Animals in Ancient Israel (AltaMira Press 1997), and Agriculture in Iron Age Israel (Eisenbrauns 1987). oborows@emory.edu

Seung Ho Bang has been a staff member of the Lahav Research Project, the Phase IV excavation at Tell Halif, Israel. He studies domestic cult objects, such as small limestone incense altars found in Tell Halif, and the relationship between domestic religious practices and household production at the end of the eighth-century BCE Tell Halif. seunghobang15@gmail.com

Kook-Young Yoon is a PhD candidate of the Sonia and Marco Nadler Institute of Archaeology at Tel Aviv University. He has conducted field work at different sites in Israel as a volunteer as well as a staff. He has been interested mainly in material culture, society, iconography and religion of the Iron Age and Persian period of Ancient Israel; his current research focuses on mechanism of manufacture and circulation of clay figurines of late Iron Age kingdom of Judah through combinative investigation of iconography, typology and petrography. kyjydw@gmail.com

Yuval Goren is professor of archaeology, head of the Track in Archaeomaterials Science and Conservation (now a Marie Curie ITN member of the European Doctorate in Archaeological Materials Science framework and Director of the Laboratory for Microarchaeology at Ben Gurion University of the Negev. His scholarly specialization is provenance and technological studies of archaeological ceramics (including seal impressions and cuneiform tablets), and the application of micromorphological methods in archaeology. His regions of focus reach from West Asia and the Levant to the eastern Mediterranean. Yuval Goren ygoren@bgu.ac.il

Sheramy Bundrick is professor of Art History at the University of South Florida St. Petersburg, where she has taught since 2001. She has held fellowships from the Metropolitan Museum of Art, the Samuel H. Kress Foundation, and the Fulbright Foundation. Most recently, she was a Rome Prize Fellow at the American Academy in Rome during the 2013-14 academic year. Her publications include Music and Image in Classical Athens (Cambridge University Press 2005), and numerous articles and chapters on on iconography, ranging from Athenian eye cups to textile production, sacrifice and Dionysian themes. In addition to her scholarly work, Professor Bundrick is the author of Sunflowers: A Novel of Vincent Van Gogh (Avon/Harper Collins 2009). bundrick@usfsp.edu

Erin Darby is assistant professor in the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Tennessee in Knoxville. Her research foci include Judean Pillar Figurines, coroplastic production, gender and sexuality, religious identities, Iron Age shrines in southern Israel and Jordan, and ongoing field work at the Late Roman Fort at ʻAyn Gharandal, Jordan. Her publications include Interpreting Judean Pillar Figurines: Gender and Empire in Judean Apotropaic Ritual (Mohr

Siebeck 2014), and numerous articles focusing on questions of method, theory, and interpretation in the context of Biblical archaeology. She is currently at work as co-editor and author on several book projects, including her next monograph Method and Theory in the Archaeology of Israelite Religion and a co-edited volume with Izaak de Hulster, Iron Age Terracotta Figurines in the Southern Levant. edarby1@utk.edu

Meghan DiLuzio is assistant professor of Classics at Baylor University; her research interests include Roman cultural history, religion in ancient Rome, and gender in antiquity. She is the author of A Place at the Altar: Priestesses in Republican Rome (Princeton University Press 2016), a recipient of the 2017 Classical Association of the Middle West and South First Book Prize. Her scholarly papers and forthcoming articles embrace topics ranging from priestly garb to intertextuality in late Latin poetry. Currently she is writing about the festivals of the Roman Republic. Meghan_DiLuzio@baylor.edu

Annewies van den Hoek was a lecturer (now retired) in Jewish and Early Christian Greek at Harvard Divinity School, and currently an associate at the Harvard Semitic Museum. Among her works are Pottery, Pavements, and Paradise: Iconographic and Textual Studies on Late Antiquity, co-authored with her husband John J. Herrmann (Brill 2013); Clément d'Alexandrie, Les Stromates. Stromate IV. Introduction, texte grec et notes par A. van den Hoek, traduction de C. Mondésert (étitions du Cerf 2001); Clement of Alexandria and his Use of Philo in the Stromateis: An Early Christian Reshaping of a Jewish Model (Brill 1988), and Light from the Age of Augustine. Late Antique Ceramics from North Africa (Tunisia) (Harvard 2002), co-authored with her husband John H. Herrmann. Annewies_vandenhoek@harvard.edu

Isabel Köster is assistant professor of classics at the University of Colorado at Boulder, studying the history and literature of the Roman Republic and early Empire with a special interest in the intersection between religion and law. Her publications include "How to Kill a Roman Villain: The Deaths of Quintus Pleminius" (Classical Journal 109 (2014): 309-332) and "Feasting Centaurs and Destructive Consuls in Cicero's In Pisonem" (Illinois Classical Studies 39 (2014): 63-79). Her current book project examines temple robbery in the Roman world from the third century BCE to the second century CE. Future projects include a study of Roman ideas about divine punishment. Isabel.koster@colorado.edu

Bert Lott is professor of Greek and Roman Studies at Vassar College, and a historian of ancient Rome. In his research he emphasizes the political, social, and religious changes associated with the beginnings of the monarchical Roman Em-

pire, as well as the development of the "epigraphic habit." His publications include The Neighborhoods of Augustan Rome (Cambridge University Press 2004) and Death and Dynasty in Early Imperial Rome (Cambridge University Press 2012). jolott@vassar.edu

Jill E. Marshall completed her PhD in the Graduate Division of Religion at Emory University. Her first book, Women Praying and Prophesying in Corinth: Gender and Inspired Speech in First Corinthians (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2017), situates Paul's arguments about prayer and prophecy within their ancient Mediterranean cultural context, using literary and archaeological evidence. Her research foci include gender, sexuality, prophecy, and magic in early Christianity, as well as the reception history of characters and locations in the New Testament. She has published articles in the Journal of Biblical Literature, Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion, and Sacred Matters Magazine. jill.marshall@emory.edu

Eric Moore completed his PhD in the Graduate Division of Religion at Emory University, with a dissertation titled 'Claiming Places', an exploration of Acts in light of Greek and Roman colonization motifs. His research bridges literary and material evidence and interactions between Jewish, Christian and Greco-Roman cultures. His current foci include inscriptions and monuments at Aphrodisias, the social sciences in New Testament interpretation, and two projects related to Acts. The first of these examines appeals to Jewish patriarchs in the speeches of Acts as a function of history writing and in light of ancestor veneration in Greek and Roman antiquity. The second explores the replication of Christianity in Luke's narrative alongside traditions of cult transfer in Greek and Roman sources. He also has plans for a work surveying the use of material culture in New Testament interpretation. epmoore0804@gmail.com

Megan Nutzman is assistant professor of history at Old Dominion University. Her work focuses on the intersection of Greco-Roman religions, Judaism, and Christianity, with a special emphasis on the land of Israel. Among her research interests are questions related to magic, material culture, and women in ancient religions. Her current project, tentatively entitled Contested Cures, identifies four categories of ritual healing in Roman and Late Antique Palestine, based on the ways that people believed miraculous cures could be transmitted: holy men, sacred places, performative acts, and amulets. Ultimately, the book uses healing rituals as a lens to investigate the construction of religious identity among Jewish and Christian authors alongside contemporary evidence for the continued borrowing and adaptation of rituals among members of the same communities. mnutzman@odu.edu

Lela Urquhart completed her PhD at Stanford University, with a dissertation focused on Colonial Religion and Indigenous Society in the Archaic Western Mediterranean, c 750-400 BCE. Her research foci include postcolonialism, ritual practice, and historiography, with a special focus on archaic Sicily. Her scholarship builds on her fieldwork at Socio-Verdura and Monte Polizzo in Sicily, Tel Dor, Mochlos, and North Carolina. Recent publications include "Competing Traditions in the Historiography of Ancient Greek Colonization in Italy", Journal of the History of Ideas 75.1 (2014): 23-44, (2014), and "English-Speaking Traditions and the Study of the Ancient Greeks Outside their Homelands," in Franco De Angelis, ed., The Blackwell Companion to Greeks across the Ancient World (Oxford 2017). Her current project is titled Measuring the Impact of Colonization: Colonial Religion and Indigenous Society in Archaic Sicily and Sardinia. lelamurquhart@gmail.com

Eric Varner is associate professor in the Departments of Art History and Classics at Emory University. His monograph (Mutilation and Transformation: Damnatio Memoriae and Roman Imperial Portraiture) and exhibition catalogue (From Caligula to Constantine: Tryanny and Transformation in Roman Portraiture) explore the destruction and reconfiguration of the portraits of Rome's "bad" emperors, including Caligula, Nero, Domitian, and Commodus. He has published articles on Roman portraits, damnatio memoriae, patronage, Roman replications of Greek sculpture, and Neronian art. He is currently completing a book examining art, literature and politics in the Neronian period entitled, Grotesque Aesthetics: Transgression and Transcendence in the Age of Nero. evarner@emory.edu

Chapter One

Sandra Blakely

Object, Image, and Text: Materiality and Ritual Practice in the Ancient Mediterranean

From Goods to Gods: The Material Turn and Ritual Studies

The "material turn" has been part of the landscape of the humanities since the 1980s, yielding a rich array of frameworks for approaching objects as agents, as socially constituted and constituting, as subjectively perceived and affectively experienced (Hicks and Beaudry 2010; Gell 1998). The roots of these interests run much deeper, however, than the late twentieth century (Taylor 2009; D. Miller 2005; Fogelin 2007). In the nineteenth century Locke and Tylor debated the boundaries between the material world and the human soul (Taylor 2009, 299). Hegel declared that engagement with the material world is a fundamental property of being human. Marx argued that the measure of a man is often the extent to which he transforms, commodifies, and accumulates the material world (Hegel 1807). In the mid-twentieth century, Merleau Ponty's phenomenology outlined the role of the embodied and the experiential human interaction with the world, rather than the merely cognized (Merleau Ponty 1945). Bourdieu's concept of habitus, affirming the role of society in concept formation and response to the material world, may be traced back to Herodotus's declarations on the role of environment in the shaping of social character (Bourdieu 1977; Taylor 2009; Lloyd 1978). The depth of the topic is matched only by the breadth of its use across disciplines, from philosophy to economics, and that are focused on objects as diverse as fine art and inorganic waste (Meskell 2005; D. Miller 2005; Lange-Berndt 2015; Gregson and Crang 2010; Dant 2005). These disciplines and topics meet in a growing number of journals, scholarly handbooks, and collections of essays devoted to "materiality."[1]

Among the many outcomes of these conversations are several points of relevance for contemporary scholars of ancient religion: these include

My appreciation goes out to Professor Brian B. Schmidt, The University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, for reading and offering comment on an earlier draft of this introduction.

1. Introductions to materiality include Buchli 2002; D. Miller 1998, 2005; P. Miller 2014; Tilley et al. 2006; journals include the *Journal of Material Culture* (Sage) and *Material Culture* (Pioneer America Society).

how religion is defined, the potential for its change over time, and religion's association with icons (Droogan 2013, 149–73). At the simplest level, ritual practice can leave material traces—objects held in the hand, monuments viewed as a group, structures approached and entered into (Fogelin 2007). Attempts to distinguish ritual from nonritual objects have sought to establish a typology of ritual materials; essential characteristics include an intensity of focus, appeal to group memory, and density of symbolic elements.[2] The raw materials of these objects, their physical location and arrangement, and the way in which structures determine group size and line of sight can be approached through the question of somatic, emotionally intensifying impact at individual, group, and social levels. The focus on nonlinguistic properties complements the determination to study religion as a social reality rather than a doctrinal debate (Boivin 2009).

The social constitution of the material world replaces the apparent concreteness of objects with a model of fluid, interactive change over time (Gosden 1994, 37). The social life of things engages them in movement between individuals, social registers, and across the boundaries of group identity (Appadurai 1986; Morehard 2015). Barth's work among the Baktaman demonstrated that even within a single society, different social registers experience objects differently; Keane has noted that the entrance of objects into new contexts gives rise to features unrelated to the intention of the previous owner (Insoll 2009; Keane 2008; Morehard and Butler 2010). Consistent with Bourdieu's habitus, multiple social entanglements yield multiple meanings. These considerations yield a more flexible paradigm for determining an object's relevance for religious practice. Objects may be ritualizing in one instance, but game pieces, artwork, or gifts to the dead in another. The life histories of objects, including the multiple cultural contexts in which they function, emerge as a critical component in the assessment of their ritual effectiveness. These contribute to creative, revolutionary models of ritual and religion as the meeting place for multiple voices (Keane 2008; Bradley 1998; Inomata 2006; Moore 1996; Fogelin 2007).

Among the objects most readily identified with ritual functions are icons and sacred images. Conceptualized as part of the cultural vocabulary of the sacred, they have often been interpreted with the aid of ancient narratives, particularly in the text-rich cultures of the Mediterranean. This has challenged scholars to develop more nuanced models for explicating the relationship between the textual and the material in ritual contexts. Semiotic and structural approaches boomed in the decades after the 1970s, emerging from the Paris School. These approaches pressed the boundaries of Saussure's linguistics as an avenue into the thought world of ancient cultures. The models they yield—in their static quality, and their inattention to cultural context—lie far from the ideals that would be

2. For the difficulty of identifying ritual, see Bradley 2005; Rowan 2012; Barrett 2016; Renfrew 1985.

pursued by scholars working in the material turn. They reflect the tendency of semiotically focused analyses to deemphasize material remains in favor of cognitive models, and focus on belief system as abstract constructions of the human mind (Tilley 1999; Boivin 2009; Barrett 2016; Renfrew and Zubrow 1994; McCorkle 2014; Lehmann 2005; Geertz 2014). More recently, however, Fogelin, Boivin, and others have revisited the question, noting that scholars since Geertz, Turner, Douglas and even Levi-Strauss have acknowledged the nonarbitrariness of signs and symbols. These are not completely independent from the materialized reality of the signifiers, but shaped by the natural properties of the symbolic material as well as arbitrary factors (Tilley 1999; Fogelin 2015). The grounding of signs in material experience replaces the need to choose between mind and material, and opens a pathway into a recoverability of the thought world of the subject cultures. This recoverability exists even despite the force of social context in determining material interaction (Gosden 1994, 37; Taylor 2009).

Scholars of religion have not, on the whole, been as engaged in the discussions of materiality as may be expected (Insoll 2004; cf. Balke and Tsouparopoulou 2015, Pongratz-Leisten and Sonik 2015; Boschung and Bremmer 2015; Houlbrook and Armitage 2015; Mylonopoulos forthcoming). At a practical level, the uneven representation of material practice across world religions limits its appeal to those scholars with access to its evidence (Meyer et al. 2014). Many religions in fact critique materiality as part of the encouragement for the transcendent (Fogelin 2015, 1–10; Taylor 2009, 300). Tendencies within the academy exacerbate the situation. Philosophical and academic voices have a long tradition of preferring mind over material, visible already in Cicero's disparagement of the work of the hands in comparison with the labor of the mind (Wood 1991, 98–99). This extends to a specific disinclination to take up the question of the gods in a highly secular Western academy, particularly in the fields of anthropology and archaeology (Insoll 2004; Boivin 2009; Droogan 2013). In the mid-twentieth century, Hawkes's "ladder of inference" emerged as a model for responsible archaeological investigation: rituals, in her schema, lie beyond firm recovery. This was paired with what Tilley characterizes as the destructive pessimism of twentieth-century archaeology that was convinced fragmentary remains had little more to reveal. Technology and economy were the sole, notable exceptions, yielding models of the social past characterized by technological and ecological determinism. The postprocessual, cognitive, symbolic focus of the 1980s moved beyond the approach to objects as adaptive technologies (Taylor 2009). These new archaeologists regarded religion and ritual as key human activities—and the doorway was reopened to an archaeology of cult (Chippindale and Taçon 1998; Tilley 1994; Scarre 2002; Whittle 1996). The constructivist perspective on those rituals has often dominated, informed by anthropological voices from Evans-Pritchard to Marshall Sahlins, who approached religion as one of the social codes

projected onto the material world. The cognized social order, rather than the materiality of the world—shaped by the humans who were in turn shaped by it—remained dominant: these are the challenges against which a materials approach is offered. A growing number of publications attest to the productive potential for material approaches to religion; these bring together case studies from across the breadth of disciplines, cultural and chronological studies that characterize approaches to materiality.[3]

Synopsis of Chapters

The chapters in this volume reflect the impact of these conversations, which are so widely diffused that they have become the necessary and implicit foundations for exploring the cultural functions material remains. The case studies gathered here situate the conversation about materiality in the ancient Mediterranean world, ranging temporally from Iron Age Israel into the Christian Imperial period. The questions of the definition of religious objects, the fluidity of socially constructed meanings, the centrality of iconographic analysis, the role for the cultural habitus which shapes the understanding and perception of objects, and the potential to erode the divide between emic and etic perspectives, all emerge across the disciplinary and regional divides represented herein. The chapters are grouped into four sections based on their primary form of evidence: iconography, text, ritual objects, and sites and structures.

In Section 1, three chapters take up the investigation from an iconographic perspective. They share a focus on the cultural productivity of the polysemicity attendant upon material evidence. Annewies van den Hoek's analysis of the Dioscuri builds on the principles of the social construction of materiality to demonstrate the polyvocality of the images of Castor and Pollux. Working back from their image on North African ceramics of the fourth and fifth century, she reconstructs their presence in the visual vocabularies of the ancient Greek and Roman worlds. Viewed as the points upon which multiple audiences converged, the twins emerge as responsive to the needs of both traditional and Christian religions. Sheramy Bundrick's study of Athenian iconography moves our focus from emic to etic. Here the multiple readers are the generations of scholars whose preference for rational models of Greek antiquity and purely narrative interpretations of ritual scenes blinded them to the cleromantic activities depicted on Athenian vases. The same astragali which enabled games were also ritual implements. They would have been as recognizable by the users of the vases as the divine implements that Susan Blevins and Meghan Diluzio

3. *Journal of Material Religion: The Journal of Objects, Art and Belief* (Taylor & Francis); Meyer et al. 2014; Insoll 2009; Rowan 2012; Laneri 2015; Barrowclough and Malone 2007; Kyriakidis 2007; Whitley and Hays-Gilpin 2008; Renfrew and Morley 2009.

explore in the context of Imperial Rome. A focus on the material technologies for communication with the gods also informs the analysis of incense altars, votive tapers, and incubation practices in other chapters. Seung Ho Bang et al. argue that the distinctive material elements of these altars reflect the potential for each house in Tell Halif to have its own, individualized radio to god. Bert Lott demonstrates that the materiality of votive tapers, simultaneously appropriate for the imperial ghosts and for personal patrons, collapsed those two categories for the citizens of Pisa. Megan Nutzman demonstrates that the careful management of the bridge between Greco-Roman and Judaic ritual categories enabled multiple communities to benefit from the ability to invoke divine healing at Hammat Gader. The polysemnic potential of both the genre of the portrait, and the material of stone, comes to the fore in Eric Varner's study of Nero's theomorphic portraits. The materiality of the stone and the cultural category of the portrait transformed the viewing of Nero's statues into a hierophantic moment, without losing the political and aesthetic force of the experience. These three chapters suggest that material religion is characterized by a polysemnity that is both productive and problematic. The materiality of ritual objects may enable cultural convergence, scholarly obfuscation, or imperial messaging, and this is seen to function in two different rituals devoted to "seeing" the gods—hierophany and cleromancy.

In Section 2, three chapters access the materiality of religion through primarily textual sources. The primacy of texts arises from different circumstances for each case study: the ephemeral nature of the objects themselves (Bert Lott), the coterminality between the production of a magical tablet and the ritual act (Jill Marshall), or because the ritualization of the object is a rhetorical achievement, carried out by Cicero in the context of legal debate (Isabel Köster). The dynamics of gift-giving run as a thread throughout all three chapters. Bert Lott's analysis begins with a Pisan inscription detailing the annual offerings to be made as public commemoration for the ghost of Augustus's son Lucius. These offerings may not consist of more than one candle, torch or wreath. These cheap and ephemeral materials, assuming a role in socially, legally, and poetically distinct exchanges, penetrate the boundaries of private family and public rites, and tie the town of Pisa to the imperial capital. The function of tapers and torches in Saturnalia, moreover, where they are gifts to would-be patrons, means that these gifts to the dead were also exchanges between client and patron. The inscription simultaneously textualizes and textualizes the candles and their light, and would itself, as an object in public space, locate the generator of these ritually forged relationships in real geo-political space. Jill Marshall shares this focus on the act of giving, exploring the term "anathema" in curse tablets and in the writings of Paul. *Anathema*, the act of dedication, appears in curse tablets from Megara and Knidos to describe the delivery of a victim to the powers of the invisible

world. The tablets, in their material form, offer life histories and user experiences that embody the complex sociology of knowledge in Paul's Corinth. The public display of tablets in Knidos moved *anathema* from the metaphoric to the physical sphere, a collapsing of symbol and action fundamental to magical practice. A palimpsest text from Megara, which simultaneously hides and reveals a divine message, makes visible the social functions of knowledge, access, distribution, and discretion. The creation of the text itself enables practitioners and purchasers to close the gap between language and artifact, physical manipulation and intellectual access. Isabel Köster explores how Cicero uses language to transform a piece of artwork into a ritual object in his invective against Verres. The sacrality of objects emerges as a social decision: it accrues to an object because of its physical location, aesthetic value, and the activities carried out around it. Verres's failure to understand these principles is articulated in terms of his absence of affect: he is devoid of the complex emotional, aesthetic, and social response that marks those for whom these finely crafted works are ritual objects. These failures render him as foreign to Rome as he was to the Sicily he plundered. The question of the gift emerges in this as in the other two chapters of this section. Verres's claim to have stolen a candelabra in order to dedicate it to Jupiter is false, as he did not understand that gifts to the gods demanded an audience.

Section 3 focuses on individual objects which may be characterized as tools in ritual contexts—altars, figurines, and the implements of ritual practice. The first two chapters focus on Israelite objects with long histories of investigation as cultic paraphernalia. They share a reliance on petrographic analysis and a focus on the question of production, and yield fresh hypotheses for the social dynamics of production. Seung Ho Bang et al. position the incense altars from Tell Halif among the archaeologies of entanglement, foregrounding the complex life histories of these ritual implements (Der and Fernandini 2016). These histories encompass local geology, the travel itineraries of the raw materials, and the politic, ethnic, and professional groupings of those involved in procurement, production, transfer, and use. Distinctions in material and finish suggest the existence of multiple artisans with differing levels and styles of craftsmanship, belonging to different households. The inherent challenges of identifying ritual objects in domestic assemblages come to the fore in the movability of these objects, whose presence could turn any number of locations into ritual spaces. The analysis of the altars' materiality, achieved through scientific as well as stylistic means, foregrounds the affective, the familial, and the local realities of ritual at Tell Halif, as well as the potential for ritual objects to serve as the carriers of contemporary narratives. Erin Darby focuses on Judean pillar figurines, traditionally interpreted as evidence for women's rituals in domestic contexts. Petrographic, stylistic, and distribution analysis offer life histories of the figurines. These were made of local soils by specialist craftsmen, reflecting the styles from

different regions, but were not themselves exchanged across political divides. These factors suggest a new hypothesis for the figurines as regional signatures, and for their workshops as loci for the negotiation of identity as well as ritual technologies.

Meghan Diluzio and Susan Blevins pursue the investigation of ritual instruments through their depiction on Roman imperial architecture. Both seek to recover the combination of memory, affect, and cultural context that would have enabled contemporary readers of these images to identify the agents missing in the depiction of the implements. Both also build on La Follette's proposal that ritual implements were not a generic set, but tailored to respond to their ritual context (La Follette 2011–2012). Blevins uses an analysis of Quintilian's rhetoric to produce an elegant reading of the frieze of the temple of the deified Titus and Vespasian, while Diluzio integrates images of Vestals in ritual action with textual evidence from Roman authors. Blevins argues that the frieze of the temple of the divine Vespasian and Titus, which consists of an array of sacred objects, invokes the Flamines, a priesthood occupied only by the senatorial elite. The depiction of implements only, without individual portraits, affirms the collective agency of their office without singling out any individual priest for honors. That priesthood's role in constituting Rome was strengthened by the rhythm of the images. Their repetition and variation mimic patterns in music and bodily movement that Quintilian recommended for sublime and pleasing thoughts, while their cyclicality would evoke the calendrical regularity of civic time that ensured the performance of remembrance and religious obligation. Meghan Diluzio uses iconographic evidence to counter the traditional arguments that the Vestals could not perform sacrifice, and that the flaminica Dialis was but a passive extension of her husband's authority. The evidence consists of the ritual implements carried in the hands of women on the Ara Pacis, depicted on the entablature frieze of the temple of Vesta, and borne along in procession on sculptural reliefs of Roman temples and altars. The implements—translated from tools into metonymns for priestly action—transcend and dissolve the boundaries of gender that have played a disproportionate role in the scholarly reconstructions of the ritual lives of Roman women.

Section 4 brings together three chapters focusing on the spatial and regional frameworks for material religion. Each of them foregrounds ritual spaces as loci for the meeting of cultures, reflecting the ethnic and geospatial reality of the polysemnity noted in the first section's chapters. Eric Moore explores water sources as producers of civic identity in Corinth and in Samaria, two communities circumscribed by Rome. Water sources have a long-recognized role as locations for the meeting of human and divine. The narratives of these interactions, and the historical, geospatial, civic, and architectural locations of the fountain of Glauke in Corinth, and Jacob's well in Samaria, link hierophantic tradition with

civic identity. Historical shifts of ownership destabilize and refine the meaning of these narratives of interaction. Under Roman occupation, the ritual functions associated with Glauke's fountain shifted away from the apotropaia offered to Medea, the barbarian, baby-killing princess. The foreign princess became a token of successfully conquered barbarian nations, and the ritual sensibility transferred from personal and familial protection to the divinely approved protection of imperial boundaries. At Jacob's well, Jesus's encounter with the Samarian woman provides a narrative of the moment of transfer of mediating power from Gerezim and Jerusalem, geospatially limited locations, to Jesus himself. This is a shift in the geospatial realities of cult from the pre-Jesus world to emergent Christianity, in which the object of celebration is emphatically transnational. The narratives enacted, ritualized, and remembered at local water sources are not only themselves capable of transformation, but emerge as tools for the scalar shift from local identities to imperial and universal reach. Megan Nutzman explores the cultural accommodations attendant upon the convergence of Greek, Roman, Jewish, and Christian identities and practices at another sacred spring, Hammat Gader. This was the most popular of the eight thermal springs in Palestine, and archaeological finds of hundreds of lamps, some seventy inscriptions, and an inscription detailing honors to fourteen different gods reflect robust engagement with the powers of the place by Greek, Roman, and Jewish individuals in search of healing. The evidence for incubation as the rite of healing seems to have been obscured by biblical writers who suppressed the evidence of this engagement in non-Jewish, traditionally Greek and Roman practices. The convergence of identities did not result in a hybrid ritual experience. While the procedures of incubation seem to have been followed by all seeking a cure, separate facilities (synagogue, church, and temple) would facilitate the preparations of purification and votive offerings consistent with the visitor's own faith traditions, and suggest the potential for each individual community to find the god or prophet of their choice in their healing dreams at the site—Asklepios for Greek and Roman, Elijah for Jews.

Lela Urquhart presents the evidence for an increase in materialized religion, both moveable finds and ritual spaces, when Greek, Sicilian, and Phoenician cultures intersect in the context of archaic Sicily. Traditional analyses of the island's cults suggested that religion was an aspect of culture that was especially slow to hellenize, and indeed that influenced the incoming Greeks, in contrast to the models of hellenization that uphold the political value of "civilizing" colonial enterprises. Urquhart uses material evidence to show the evidence for change in indigenous Sicilian religions, focusing on central western Sicily: physical correlates of ritual increased; ritual action shifted from graves to gods; and rituals changed from loosely to highly structured. The quantification of material correlates, a type of data distinctive to material studies, is critical in the argument. Extratextuality,

as a framework for conceptualizing ritual as both text and discourse, provides a catalyst for opening up the implications of these data. Rituals as texts are part of the broader cultural discourses in which symbolic systems support and demand an act of interpretation. These interpretations move between fixed conventions and object-based interpretation carried out by both ancient participants and etic scholars. Each ritual, thus viewed, becomes one conversation conducted within the frame of the cultural language that enabled communication among gods, residents, and foreigners. Historical texts that reflect back on the context of these conversations emphasize ongoing cultural evolution, capable of both conflict and collaboration. Practice theorists underscore the engagement with both material devices and texts in the transformation of meaning, on the part of primary actors as well as scholarly interpreters. The arc drawn between historical texts, ancient context, and material evidence validates a model of cross-cultural engagement significantly worked out through the medium of material religion.

Themes

Four themes emerge across these sections that bind the chapters to each other and suggest specific ways in which ancient Mediterranean cultures contribute to the conversations about materiality and religion. These include the creation of the sacred, the significance of texts, the crossing of cultural boundaries, and the centrality of interpretation. The assembled chapters approach the creation of the sacred through a combination of rhetorical, material, and iconographic paths. Cicero uses his rhetorical skills to define a piece of artwork as a sacred object, effectively producing its status as divine. His achievement relies on the permeability of the line between sacred and secular that informs the theomorphic portraits of Nero. This generative rhetoric of the sacred resonates as well with archaeological debates engaged in Urquahrt's discussion of Sicilian small finds, and Bundrick's argument for depictions of astragali: When is an object a votive gift communicating with the divine, and when is it simply a personal possession? The production of more unambiguously ritual objects—incense altars and pillar figurines—expands this conversation to the sociology of ancient workshops, and their location of the sacred in daily topographies.

The abundance of literary sources from the ancient Mediterranean cultures relevant for these papers have both propelled and held back the application of theoretical debates in the archaeologies of the region. The risks of preferring ancient authors over material finds, the elitism of the texts, and the complexities of both literary genres and material evidence are core characteristics of Mediterranean archaeologies. These chapters suggest that one outcome of a material focus is a productive dissolution of the gap between text and object, a dissolution in which the life-world of the object, the viewer, the user, and

the interpreter emerge as primary foci of interpretation. The chapters in this volume demonstrate that textual witnesses to the uses of ritual implements, their appearance in processions, and the social strata familiar with them are a sine qua non in material analysis. Several of these chapters offer particularly nuanced approaches. Blevins dissolves the separation between the rhetorical principles which would shape both gesture and speech among educated Romans and the visual world of the temple friezes. Marshall refines the semantics of "anathema" in both magical and biblical texts in exploring the ability of curse tablets to simultaneously hide and reveal. And in Urquhart's use of extratextuality, ritual itself becomes a text, one among numerous malleable building blocks in a culture's symbolic system. Its historical usefulness emerges from the constant dialogue between fixity and objectification.

Materials that facilitate human interaction with the divine are often, in these chapters, simultaneously the point of interaction among distinct political or ethnic identities. Material objects may pass through many hands and, particularly if they are fine works of art, multiple contexts. Ritual spaces tend to draw visitors from more than one cultural context, and ritual objects themselves may combine cultural signatures as part of their articulation of authority. The capacity of a single image to convey multiple meanings is foundational to the longevity of the Dioskouroi; the shift from a Greek to a Roman context transformed the narrative semantics and the ritual force of the fountain of Glauke in Corinth; the capacity for some visitors to find Asklepios, others Elijah enabled a diverse and long-lived community of pilgrims at Hammat Gader. These boundary crossings are not simply the accidental eventualities in the life world of objects and images. An active appeal to the ethnographic other is a source of authority in the language of the curse tablets, and the potential for ritual action to close the divide between Pisa and Rome, and private citizens and the imperial house, shapes the rituals for Lucius. A concretization of the gods or the avenues to them often, perhaps ironically or unexpectedly, leads to a fluidity of meaning and interpretation—one coterminous with the crossing of ethnic, religious, and political boundaries.

This polysemnity lies at the heart of the fourth common point: the centrality of interpretation to ritual experience. These multiple readings of objects and spaces derive from an awareness of the cultural embeddedness of embodied, cognized, affectively, and aesthetically experienced ritual. This embeddedness argues against models of hybridity, in favor of a more dynamic model of the human experiences created through interaction around material goods. For Diluzio and Blevins, this is the shared cultural experience of watching processions and sharing sacrificial meals. For Köster it is Cicero's scathing critique of Verres's blindness to the ritual norms of the cultures he robbed as well as the Roman culture he sought to inhabit. That interpretive process is shared by both the ancient emic audiences, and the etic interpreters of the modern era. Bundrick

identifies the role of scholarly prejudice in shaping centuries of interpretation of images. Darby's approach to the Judean pillar figurines is a direct response to the nearly canonical assumption that these were the ritual implements of women; Urquhart's extratextuality provides a framework in which precisely this process of interpretation is common ground for the ancient and the scholarly world. This casts down the gauntlet for scholars to acknowledge not simply their own culturally embedded biases, but also the potential for material evidence—held in the hand, seen with the eye, and interpreted most naturally from multiple perspectives—to advance our investigations of religion in the ancient world.

Bibliography

Appadurai, Arjun (ed.) 1986. *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Balke, Thomas E., and Christina Tsouparopoulou, eds. 2015. *Materiality of Writing in Early Mesopotamia*. Materiale Textkulturen 13. Berlin: de Gruyter.

Barrett, Caitlín E. 2016. "Archaeology of Ancient Religions." *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Religion*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. doi: 10.1093/acrefore/9780199340378.013.48.

Barrowclough, David, and Caroline Malone, eds. 2007. *Cult in Context: Reconsidering Ritual in Archaeology*. Oxford: Oxbow.

Boivin, Nicole. 2009. "Grasping the Elusive and Unknowable: Material Culture in Ritual Practice." *Material Religion* 5:266–287.

Boschung, Dietrich, and Jan N. Bremmer, ed.s. 2015. *The Materiality of Magic*. Morphomata 20. Paderborn: Fink.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1977. *Outline of a Theory of Practice.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bradley, Richard. 1998. *The Significance of Monuments: On the Shaping of Human Experience in Neolithic and Bronze Age Europe*. London: Routledge.

———. 2005. *Ritual and Domestic Life in Prehistoric Europe.* London: Routledge.

Buchli, Victor, ed. 2002. *The Material Culture Reader.* Oxford: Berg.

Chippindale, Christopher, and Paul Taçon. 1998. *The Archaeology of Rock-Art.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Dant, Tim. 2005 *Materiality and Society.* Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Der, Lindsay, and Francesca Fernandini, eds. 2016. *Archaeology of Entanglemen*t. London: Routledge.

Droogan, Julian. 2013. *Religion, Material Culture, and Archaeology*. Bloomsbury Advances in Religious Studies. New York: Bloomsbury Academic.

Fogelin, Lars. 2007. "The Archaeology of Religious Ritual." *ARA* 36:55–71.

———. 2015. *An Archaeological History of Indian Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Geertz, Armin W. 2014. *Origins of Religion, Culture and Cognition*. New York: Routledge.

Gell, Alfred. 1998. *Art and Agency: An Anthropological Theory*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Gosden, Christopher. 1994. *Social Being and Time*. Social Archaeology. Oxford: Blackwell.

Gregson, Nicky, and Mike Crang. 2010. "Materiality and Waste: Inorganic Vitality in a Networked World." *Environment and Planning A* 42:1026–1032.

Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. 1807. *Phänomenologie des Geistes*. Würzburg: Goebhardt.

Hicks, Dan, and Mary C. Beaudry. 2010. "Introduction: Material Culture Studies; A Reactionary View." Pages 1–24 in *The Oxford Handbook of Material Culture Studies*. Edited by Dan Hicks and Mary C. Beaudry. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Houlbrook, Ceri, and Natalie Armitage, eds. 2015. *The Materiality of Magic*. Oxford: Oxbow.

Inomata, Takeshi. 2006. "Plazas, Performers, and Spectators: Political Theaters of the Classic Maya." *CA* 42:805–42.

Insoll, Tim. 2004. "Are Archaeologists Afraid of Gods? Some Thoughts on Archaeology and Religion." Pages 1–6 in *Belief in the Past: The Proceedings of the 2002 Manchester Conference on Archaeology and Religion*. Edited by Tim Insoll. BARIS 1212. Oxford: Archaeopress.

———. 2009. "Materiality, Belief, Ritual: Archaeology and Material Religion, an Introduction." *Material Religion* 5:260–64.

Keane, Webb. 2008. "The Evidence of the Senses and the Materiality of Religion." Pages S110–S127 in *The Objects of Evidence: Anthropological Approaches to the Production of Knowledge*. Special issue of *JRAI* 14.

Kyriakidis, Evangelos, ed. 2007. *The Archaeology of Ritual*. Cotsen Advanced Seminars 3. Los Angeles: Cotsen Institute of Archaeology, University of California.

La Follette, Laetitia. 2011–2012. "Parsing Piety: The Sacred Still Life in Roman Relief Sculpture." *MAAR* 56/57:15–35.

Laneri, Nicola, 2015. *Defining the Sacred: Approaches to the Archaeology of Religion in the Near East*. Oxford: Oxbow Books.

Lange-Berndt, Petra, ed., 2015. *Materiality*. Documents of Contemporary Art. London: Whitechapel Gallery.

Lehmann, David. 2005. "The Cognitive Approach to Understanding Religion." *Archives de sciences sociales des religions* 131–132:199–213.

Lloyd, Geoffrey E.R., ed. 1978. *Hippocratic writings*. Translated by John Chadwick and W. N. Mann. Harmondsworth: Pelican.

McCorkle, William. 2014. "Cognitive Historiography: Religion as an Artifact of Culture and Cognition." *JCH* 1.2. doi:10.1558/jch.v1i2.25883.

Merleau Ponty, Maurice. 1945. *Phénoménologie de la perception*. Bibliothèque des Idées. Paris: Gallimard.

Meskell, Lynn. 2005. *Archaeologies of Materiality*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Meyer, Birgit, David Morgan, Crispin Paine, and S. Brent Platt. 2014. "*Material Religion*'s First Decade." *Material Religion* 10:105–11.

Miller, Daniel, ed. 1998. *Material Cultures: Why Some Things Matter*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

———, ed. 2005. *Materiality*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Miller, Peter N. 2014 *Cultural Histories of the Material World*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Moore, Jerry D. 1996. *Architecture and Power in the Ancient Andes*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Morehard, Christopher T. 2015."Archaeologies of the Past and in the Present 2014: Materialities of Human History." *American Anthropologist* 117:329–44.

Morehart, Christopher T., and Noah Butler. 2010. "Ritual Exchange and the Fourth Obligation: Ancient Maya Food Offering and the Flexible Materiality of Ritual." *JRAI* 16:588–608.

Mylonopoulos, Joannis, ed. Forthcoming. *Materiality and Visibility of Rituals in the Ancient World*. Berlin: de Gruyter

Pongratz-Leisten, Beate, and Karen Sonik, eds. 2015.*The Materiality of Divine Agency*. SANER 8. Berlin: de Gruyter.

Renfrew, Colin. 1985. *The Archaeology of Cult: The Sanctuary at Phylakopi*. Archaeology of Cult 18. Athens: British School of Archaeology at Athens.

Renfrew, Colin, and Ezra Zubrow, eds. 1994. *The Ancient Mind: Elements of Cognitive Archaeology*. New Directions in Archaeology. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Renfrew, Colin, and Iain Morley, eds. 2009. *Becoming Human: Innovation In Prehistoric Material and Spiritual Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rowan, Yorke M., ed. 2012. *Beyond Belief: The Archaeology of Religion and Ritual*. APAAA 21. Malden, MA: Wiley.

Scarre, Christopher. 2002. *Monuments and Landscape in Atlantic Europe: Perception and Society during the Neolithic and Early Bronze Age*. London: Routledge.

Taylor, Tim. 2009. "Materiality." Pages 297–320 in *Handbook of Archaeological Theories*. Edited by R. Alexander Bentley, Herbert D.G. Maschner, and Christopher Chippindale. Lantham, MD: Altamira Press.

Tilley, Christopher. 1994. *A Phenomenology of Landscape: Places, Paths, and Monuments*. Explorations in Anthropology. Oxford: Berg.

———. 1999. *Metaphor and Material Culture.* Social Archaeology. Oxford: Blackwell.

Tilley, Christopher, Webb Keane, Susanne Kuechler-Fogden, Mike Rowlands, and Patricia Spyer, eds. 2006. *Handbook of Material Culture.* London: Sage.

Whittle, Alastair W. R. 1996. *Europe in the Neolithic: The Creation of New Worlds.* CWA. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Whitley, David, and Kelley Hays-Gilpin, eds. 2008. *Belief in the Past: Theoretical Approaches to the Archaeology of Religion*. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press.

Wood, Neal. 1991. *Cicero's Social and Political Thought.* Berkeley: University of California Press.